

Meeting Minutes for Cleaner Air for Scotland Governance Group

Location: Forth Valley College, Stirling Campus, Drip Road, Stirling, FK8 1SE
Date: 7 March 2017
Time: 10:00 – 13:00

Present

Graham Applegate, GA (SEPA)	Vincent McNally, VM (Glasgow City Council)
Janet Brown, JB (City of Edinburgh Council)	Janice Milne, JM (SEPA)
Lorna Bryce, LB (SEPA)	Eleanor Pratt, EP (SEPA/SG)
James Curran, JC (Scottish Environment Link)	Neil Ritchie, NR (Scottish Government)
Gillian Dick, GD (Heads of Planning Scotland)	Neil Sturrock, NS (SPT)
Colin Gillespie, CG (SEPA)	Andrew Taylor, AT (Scottish Government)
Emilia Hanna, EH (Scottish Environment Link)	Stephen Thomson, ST (Transport Scotland)
Drew Hill, DH (Transport Scotland)	Iris Whyte, IW (Dundee City Council)
David Kernohan, DK (SG Health Protection)	

Additional Attendees

Michelagh O'Neill and Ruth Wolstenholme, Sniffer

Chair

Neil Ritchie (Scottish Government)

Apologies

Aileen Brodie, AB (Aberdeen City Council)	Martin Marsden, MM (SEPA)
Bruce Kiloh, BK (SPT)	Colin Ramsay, CR (Health Protection Scotland)

Item	Title	Action
1.	<p><u>Welcome and introductions</u></p> <p>NS was welcomed as substitute for BK.</p>	
2.	<p><u>NLEF Update</u></p> <p>ST provided a general NLEF update.</p> <p><u>Resourcing</u></p> <p>Transport Scotland has now recruited three new staff to support its air quality work: an administrator, initially for 1-3 months, but hoped to be permanent; an 18 month placement for an environmental manager to support NLEF, and an additional senior environmental engineer.</p> <p><u>NLEF Appraisal Guidance Documents</u></p> <p>First and second drafts of the NLEF appraisal guidance documents have been received from Atkins and circulated to the NLEF Steering Group. A number of critical comments were received back and are being addressed. ST acknowledged concerns regarding links with the NMF, LAQM and delivery timescales. ST confirmed he has asked the Scottish Government Legal</p>	

	<p>Directorate for advice regarding legislation for enforcement of LEZs.</p> <p>Key tasks: development of full NLEF document incorporating tracked changes; ministerial submission of 'state of readiness report' for 2018 LEZ; developing final objectives for NLEF.</p> <p>Transport Scotland have also asked Jacobs to provide a detailed economic assessment for LEZs (summary of economic costs of LEZ infrastructure, enforcement, retrofitting, communications etc.), together with the development of a full business case for LEZs for submission to the Transport Scotland Investment Decision Making (IDM) board, then to ministers. This IDM paper will cover social and environmental benefits of LEZs. It is expected that this should be complete in the next 3 months. ST aware that the NLEF timetable needs to be updated (no comments received as per action at last CAFS GG meeting – see s.5 below).</p> <p>Current priority is to develop the NLEF stage/version 1 document to implement the 2018 LEZ. The intention is to develop this process by the end of March 2017, which will form the basis of the first consultation for NLEF. Following this the 'full' NLEF document will go for consultation.</p> <p>Concerns were expressed that too much detail on the economic assessment may cause delays to progress the government commitment to a 2018 LEZ – the assessment should be simple and straightforward. It was however noted that cost/benefit information is important to LAs to justify spend to save decision making and encourage others to take up LEZs. ST confirmed that development of the 2018 LEZ process can work in parallel with the assessment of costs.</p> <p>The importance of the economic business case being developed collaboratively with LA input was stressed. ST confirmed the report will be available to LA members and invited group members to sit in on the inception meeting with Jacobs if desired. It would also be helpful for LAs to see the Cost Benefit Analysis spreadsheet mentioned in the draft NLEF appraisal document in order to review its inputs and assumptions.</p>	
3.	<p><u>2018 LEZ Process</u></p> <p>ST met the Traffic Commissioner (TC) for Scotland on 28 Feb to discuss her thoughts/role regarding a 2018 LEZ focussed on buses. The TC confirmed that she is in favour of LEZs and emission control and that amendments to Public Service Vehicle (PSV) operator licences to reduce emissions must be based on Traffic Regulation Conditions (TRCs). Evidence must be provided to prove that the change is worthwhile and necessary to address emissions, together with information on the impact on buses (# buses, age/emission profile, bus routes, impact on bus patronage, vehicle displacement etc.) and any positive impacts on congestion.</p>	

The TRC must be tested with stakeholders via consultation which may raise objections; this would lead to an enquiry that the TC would chair. The TC wants any TRC to be informed by NMF evidence and the NLEF process, and would like reductions in congestion to be achieved via Intelligent Transport Systems (ITS). Placemaking was mentioned, as was the need for a clear timescale on what would happen when. The TC also does not want the bus sector to be demonised and wants to ensure continued bus access to reduce reliance on private vehicles.

It was queried whether, given the difficult timescales involved, there was any scope for ministerial direction to be given. The objections process for TRCs has the potential to greatly slow down the LEZ process; ministerial direction would greatly help to overcome this. It was suggested that ST raise this during his ongoing discussions with the Scottish Government Legal Directorate.

It was stated by EH that Friends of the Earth Scotland (FoES) do not feel they can support the TRC route, which would only be able to target buses, when FoES want an LEZ in place for 2018 which would cover a variety of vehicle types, with hard infrastructure to create a legacy for future schemes. FoES feel that the better mechanism to enable a LEZ which would apply emissions standards to multiple vehicle classes would be a Traffic Regulation Order (TRO). If the use of TRCs is confirmed as the route to the 2018 LEZ, EH will no longer continue to represent Scottish Environment Link on the CAFS Governance Group, unless there is some guarantee that the 2018 LEZ will also cover other vehicle classes from the outset. This was acknowledged.

It was highlighted that the focus on one element of the transport fleet was intended only for the 2018 LEZ, given the tight timeframes involved; this will be a structured process that will be ratcheted up beyond 2018 for subsequent NLEF schemes. The 2018 LEZ will use TRCs to reduce emissions from buses, whereas post-2018 schemes will use TROs to reduce emissions from a broader range of vehicle types. A possible third route discussed was an initial voluntary approach using Statutory Quality Partnerships (SQPs), followed by a statutory arrangement using TRCs/TROs, although it was felt that any 'voluntary' process would be very unlikely to achieve results in the required timescales. 'Legacy' can mean hard infrastructure, but should also be seen to cover engagement/ behaviour change to see LEZs as a positive.

Discussion followed around whether the EU ambient air quality directives are likely to be met by 2020. It was noted that although Scotland is currently failing EU directives in 4 out of 6 'zones' in Scotland, modelling shows that 3 of these will be compliant by 2020 (original date for compliance was 2015), but that the fourth, which is linked to trunk roads is unlikely to be solved by an LEZ. However reducing emissions from buses will likely significantly help compliance with LAQM and revocation of AQMAs. It was agreed that a

	<p>future meeting of the CAFS GG should include a focussed discussion to confirm progress towards meeting domestic and EU targets for air quality.</p> <p>An important next step for the 2018 LEZ is to understand potential impacts on bus operators. ST confirmed that Transport Scotland plans to run four major city workshops with RTPs, operators etc. to understand what is achievable in terms of retrofitting etc. This information can then be fed into the transport models to understand impacts on routes, passengers etc.</p> <p>Action 1: ST to find date for a face-to-face meeting ASAP to agree detail of guiding principles 2018 approach (e.g. emission standards, enforcement regime, euro categories etc.) ALL to express interest in attending to ST.</p>	<p>ST/ALL</p>
<p>4.</p>	<p><u>2018 LEZ Communications</u></p> <p>Sniffer are a charity specialising in facilitating collaborative ways of working and stakeholder engagement. They have carried out previous work on CAFS, including coordinating engagement with LA Elected Members. M'ON provided an overview of the project commissioned on behalf of the CAFS Governance and Communications group last year. This project was originally intended to test concepts for a public awareness campaign on air quality. However, given the timescales for the 2018 LEZ, the scope of the project has now changed in order to support stakeholder engagement on the NLEF and 2018 LEZ.</p> <p>Sniffer attended the meeting in order to better understand what is required in terms of engagement needs and will tailor the project accordingly. Previously Sniffer had been mapping general stakeholder groups, with the intention of running focus groups to test various air quality messages. A more pressing need now is to focus in more on 'priority' stakeholder groups (bus, freight and taxis), while not duplicating existing work like the bus sector engagement workshops being planned by Transport Scotland.</p> <p>2 questions were asked of the group regarding stakeholders (bus companies/operators, freight operators, taxi operators):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - What does the CAFS GG want from engagement with stakeholders? - What might stakeholders need/want from engagement with the CAFS GG/each other? <p>Discussion was captured and will be fed back on by Sniffer. The general consensus was that stakeholders required the ability to discuss and address their feelings and fears over LEZs, rather than being presented with extensive facts and figures. Mechanisms for continued engagement/feedback need to be developed. Sniffer will need to collate key messages.</p> <p>It was noted that there had been significant resourcing issues for CAFS</p>	

	<p>communications, but that SG/SEPA have now committed to resourcing this work. Once this new resource in place the scope of the project will be reviewed in order to ensure it adds value to the work and does not duplicate the workshops Transport Scotland intend to run.</p> <p>Action 2: ST/EP to confirm how Sniffer project to link to Transport Scotland city workshops.</p>	ST/EP
4.	<p><u>NMF Update</u></p> <p>CG provided an update on the NMF work. The air quality indicator project is currently experiencing some delays, but is expected to be back on track shortly. Publication of the peer review of the Aberdeen process has also been delayed, but all comments have been taken on board and actions from the report are being progressed.</p> <p>Development of the regional model is showing good initial results based on the Dutch approach. Work will begin shortly with Strathclyde Partnership for Transport (SPT) as they have the most up to date regional transport model.</p> <p>Work on the city modelling is continuing, with scenarios being run using the air quality model to determine impacts of certain areas of the fleet being cleaned up. Edinburgh traffic data collection is complete and being fed into the model. Significant roadworks in Dundee will likely impact on the collection of representative traffic data, so this has been postponed until Sep 2017, which will delay development of the Dundee model. Data collection for Aberdeen has therefore been brought forward to keep the overall NMF work on track as much as possible.</p> <p>The data analysis tools are now live as beta versions on the Scottish Air Quality website, which will provide a platform for the LA NMF modelling information to be hosted.</p>	
5.	<p><u>Minutes and actions from last meeting</u></p> <p>Action 1: ALL to provide comments on the revised NLEF timetable back to ST ASAP, ignoring '2018 LEZ' section, which will be updated further (see item 4 below). OPEN – Timetable to be updated further by ST, all to continue to provide input.</p> <p>Action 2: ST to circulate 'crib sheet' on what questions NLEF should address, ALL to feedback. OPEN – currently under development.</p> <p>Action 4: Interim 2018 LEZ guidance note to be adjusted accordingly between TS/SEPA/SG and LAs. SUPERSEDED by Action 1 above.</p> <p>Action 7: LB to circulate draft CAFS content for SAQ website to Governance</p>	<p>ST/ALL</p> <p>ST</p>

	<p>GG, however this needs to happen at the right time. A 'stock take' of membership should be considered at a future meeting, and consideration given to when to hold strategic level meetings to include 'business' stakeholders. There also needs to be a meeting focussed on the placemaking elements of CAFS.</p> <p>Action 5: EP to update 'work plan' of meetings – to include placemaking, risk, and membership.</p>	
8.	Thanks and Close	