Meeting Minutes for Cleaner Air for Scotland Governance Group

Location: SEPA, Strathallan House, Castle Business Park, Stirling
Date: 29 Sep 2017
Time: 10:00 – 13:00

Present
Aileen Brodie, AB (Aberdeen City Council)  
Lorna Bryce, LB (SEPA)  
Shauna Clarke, SC (City of Edinburgh Council)  
Gillian Dick, GD (Heads of Planning Scotland)  
Emilia Hanna, EH (Scottish Environment Link)  
David Kernohan, DK (SG Health Protection)  
Martin Marsden, MM (SEPA)  
Vincent McInally, VM (Glasgow City Council)  
Janice Milne, JM (SEPA)  
Eleanor Pratt, EP (SEPA/SG)  
Neil Ritchie, NR (Scottish Government)  
Yvette Sheppard, YS (Transport Scotland)  
Andrew Taylor, AT (Scottish Government)  
Stephen Thomson, ST (Transport Scotland)  
Iris Whyte, IW (Dundee City Council)

Chair
Neil Ritchie (Scottish Government)

Apologies
Graham Applegate, GA (SEPA)  
James Curran, JC (Scottish Environment Link)  
Colin Gillespie, CG (SEPA)  
Bruce Kiloh, BK (SPT)  
Colin Ramsay, CR (Health Protection Scotland)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Welcome and introductions</td>
<td>It was noted that Glasgow City Council had approved the report presented to committee on 28 Sep 2017 recommending that an LEZ be introduced in the city by the end of 2018.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2. | CAFS GG review and forward planning | The CAFS GG has now been operational for 18 months. NR noted that:  
- Strategic-level quarterly meetings haven’t taken place, due to the pace of ongoing work and outside engagement.  
- Much of the CAFS GG discussion has focussed on LEZs.  
- There is the need to consider new structures now coming online to support the LEZ work, and how to refocus the CAFS GG on wider CAFS deliverables beyond just LEZs.  
General reflections from CAFS GG  
- There is a need to return to maintaining an oversight role across the entirety of CAFS delivery, although it was acknowledged that the group must also continue to have oversight of work to deliver LEZs. |
Use of ‘dashboards’ suggested to ensure discussion is not overly detailed.

- A wider focus acknowledgement of clean air issues across Scotland and increased engagement with local authorities beyond the 4 cities is required.

- The planned work using the Place Standard tool can help achieve this by facilitating conversations beyond environmental health/transport, and with the wider community. Training for development managers on air quality also requires to be delivered, which CAFS is well placed to manage, in conjunction with HOPs and the Improvement Service. The need to remain engaged with the process to update Scottish Planning Policy and National Planning Framework as part of the review of the planning system was highlighted – the forthcoming Planning Bill will be a key influence in the coming year.

- The CAFS GG recognised the wider network of groups it could link into such as the Air Pollution and Health sub-group of the Scottish Health Protection Network (SHPN). Work of these groups should be supported.

- There is the need to revisit how feedback is being sought from ‘sub-groups’. Greater transparency/feedback from the GG to wider organisations – regular newsletter/briefing note required.

- Suggestion made that NGO connections could be increased, such as those in the health sector e.g. British Heart/Lung Foundation. Transparency around CAFS activities to these organisations should be improved.

- Seeking better focus at meetings, moving forward on deliverables and improved transparency/two way exchange with others.

Membership

Suggested changes to/additional members included:

- Improved attendance from the Regional Transport Partnerships (RTPs)/Society of Chief Officers of Transportation (SCOTS) would be appreciated

**Action 1: Bruce Kiloh (SPT) to appoint a deputy.**

- Broad support for representation from business on the group. Transport Scotland are meeting with the Federation of Small Businesses and Glasgow Chamber of Commerce re: LEZs and can test the water.
- Potential role for academia to provide research updates on air quality (horizon scanning) and to perform a challenge function.

- Need to ensure LA representation beyond environmental health. This is covered via Heads of Planning Scotland (HOPS), Society of Chief Officers of Transportation (SCOTS) and Environmental Health representatives from the 4 cities, who represent the Local Pollution Control Liaison Group agglomerations (which cover all LAs), rather than just the 4 cities, although up until now issues have been focussed on these areas.

- Representation from a non ‘4-city’ based local authority also required. A representative from Perth was suggested.

**Action 2: IW to identify through SPCCC a potential rural based council.**

**Links to other groups**

There is a need to be clear what are actually ‘sub-groups’ of the CAFS GG (i.e. those directly accountable to the CAFS GG e.g. the NMF group), and what are stand-alone groups with their own governance/funding that feed into the CAFS GG, but are not directly accountable to it (e.g. the Air Pollution and Health group, which is a sub-group of the Scottish Health Protection Network, rather than the CAFS GG).

Some form of dashboard update is required for Place work, NMF and LEZ delivery.

Consideration given to a repeat session with the Transport Scotland policy leads re: CAFS transport actions, similar to CAFS GG meeting in June 2016. Transport Scotland feel that this would be of limited help to the policy leads, and that updates from the leads are better sought out-with the Governance Group. As with other groups, need further thought about how CAFS GG can remain informed to ensure common understanding of e.g. NTS refresh.

It was agreed we should retain the core meeting structure, with adhoc invites to wider organisations issued as required.

**Forward meeting planning**

After this meeting a draft future work plan will be developed and circulated for comment/ addition. It was suggested the group could consider meeting virtually e.g. via Skype. It was proposed that any future review of CAFS be discussed at a future meeting.

**Action 3: ALL to come back to EP with further suggestions for CAFS GG membership, wider groups we should be linking up with and how, and further suggestions for future meeting topics. EP to draft paper/summary.**
3. Programme for Government Update

ST provided an overview of the three main elements pertinent to air quality in the recent Programme for Government (PfG) announcement:

- Commitment to introducing LEZs into Scotland’s four biggest cities by 2020 (1st one still by 2018) and into all other AQMAs where NLEF shows this is required by 2023;
- Introduce an air quality fund which will be separate to LAQM funding to support NLEF based non-LEZ mitigation e.g. traffic light signalling;
- Introduce an engine retrofitting centre (not standalone ‘garage’ but a virtual set up using already existing garages) to enable retrofitting of buses at speed required for 2018/2020 dates.

It was suggested that as other LEZs may not initially cover buses, that this last measure should be prioritised towards Glasgow, rather than nationally. It was queried when the retrofitting centre is likely to be operational, and concerns expressed about what information/advice should be being provided to operators. There are potential issues including a lack of trained/accredited technicians; availability of accredited retrofit kit, and compatibility of this kit with chassis types currently in use in Scotland. It is hoped that Green Bus Fund (GBF) monies can be used to identify buses in Scotland not currently using chassis types compatible with the accredited kit.

It was noted that Roseanna Cunningham’s Parliamentary Statement on air quality focussed very much on buses in a positive capacity to mitigate negative feedback around the initial focus on buses for Glasgow. Questions following the statement included the value of public transport and the importance of a national framework/consistency.

4. 2018 LEZ

The Cabinet Secretary for Environment’s statement on 27 Sep confirmed the creation of a ministerially-led 4-cities LEZ leadership group. The likely structure for LEZ delivery will be:

- 4-cities Leadership group, chaired by the ECCLR Cabinet Secretary and/or the Minister for Transport and the Islands, with membership from LA councillors, and possibly senior officials. Letters from the Cab Sec ECCLR and Minister for Transport and the Islands were issued to the 4 LA CEOs and heads of council on Wednesday inviting them to the group. These should be responded to as soon as possible to allow that group to be set up.
- Tactical 4-cities group with representation from senior officials to ensure consistent decision making across the cities and feeding to/from leadership group.
- Four operational city-based LEZ delivery groups to deliver specific LEZ commitments for those cities. Collaboration between TS and LAs to develop membership; letters issued requesting engagement on this have been issued.

**Action 5:** ST to circulate letters sent to LAs re LEZ leadership and city delivery groups to CAFS GG for information.

**Timeline**

Critical issues discussed:
- Preparing submission to Traffic Commissioner for first LEZ: initial suggestion was December 2017, but this date will be revised in reflection of developments; e.g. confirmation of where first LEZ will be. SEPA has now drafted a template for the Traffic Commissioner submission which has been circulated to Transport Scotland and LAs for comment.

**Action 6:** VM to feedback to CAFS GG on likely date for Traffic Commissioner submission, dependent on developments.

- Transport models: required to evidence impact of congestion measures for Traffic Commissioner submission: a meeting between Glasgow City Council, Transport Scotland and SPT has taken place to consider what is required to update the model, but it is unlikely this will be in time for submission – model likely to be used as-is and updated for future years.
- Back office infrastructure for enforcement: discussions on how shared services might work need to start, now LEZ city groups are being set up.
- Defining objectives: to be covered in October meeting re: KPI development.
- Funding: budget to be announced in December.
- Placemaking work: progressing subject to funding.
- Bus retrofitting issues as noted above to be added to ‘red flag’ list.

It was suggested that clearer visioning is required to demonstrate how other vehicle classes will be addressed, and to show how buses fit into the wider picture, as well as making sure elected members have a full understanding of the options available to them. This will be for discussion within the LEZ delivery groups which will use the NMF evidence to consider what vehicle classes to cover where, run scenario testing and communicate this to committees. Improved transport modelling also required to ensure the full impact of interventions is understood.

It was noted that the Glasgow LEZ is intended to cover all vehicles entering the city centre, but will be prioritised towards buses first, as they are the most significant contributor in streets with the highest emissions, although it will also be vital to communicate other policies (e.g. around parking) for that area that will impact wider vehicle classes, reduce numbers of cars and vans etc. Anti-congestion measures are vital to the implementation of the LEZ.
Stronger comms at a local council and CAFS level is required to manage media reaction e.g. from committee papers being made public – advance briefing of stakeholders ideally to avoid reactionary questions from journalists etc.

Transport Scotland have drafted a ‘dashboard’ to be used to communicate progress with LEZ work and facilitate more succinct dialogue on critical issues at CAFS GG meetings. This will be circulated prior to CAFS GG meetings along with the NMF update. Transport Scotland have also recruited a ‘briefing and correspondence officer to deal with media enquiries, drafting lines for ministers etc. There is also the intention to recruit both a project manager for the LEZ work (YS will be tracking in the meantime), and someone to support the Transport Bill work.

5. Communications

It was noted that further work on comms is required, in terms of the deliverables committed to in CAFS, and additional work e.g. LEZ comms that is required to be delivered at an individual organisational level. It was agreed to review National Clean Air Day at the next meeting, in order to consider its use as a focal point for the public awareness campaign commitment of CAFS.

Action 7: EP to include NCAD for discussion on next meeting agenda.

There is the need for greater CAFS GG transparency – this should be achieved through further development of the CAFS page of the Scottish Air Quality website to allow it to be updated more frequently with minutes, briefing notes etc. to ensure a greater stakeholder awareness of what is happening.

Action 8: AT to liaise with Ricardo to update website more frequently.

6. Thanks and Close