

Meeting Minutes for Cleaner Air for Scotland Governance Group

Location: Teleconference
Date: 30 Oct 2017
Time: 10:00 – 11:00

Present

Aileen Brodie, AB (Aberdeen City Council)	Eleanor Pratt, EP (SEPA/SG)
Lorna Bryce, LB (SEPA)	Colin Ramsay, CR (Health Protection Scotland)
Shauna Clarke, SC (City of Edinburgh Council)	Neil Ritchie, NR (Scottish Government)
Emilia Hanna, EH (Scottish Environment Link)	Kirsty Steven, KS (Perth and Kinross Council)
Drew Hill, DH (Transport Scotland)	Andrew Taylor, AT (Scottish Government)
David Kernohan, DK (SG Health Protection)	Iris Whyte, IW (Dundee City Council)
Vincent McInally, VM (Glasgow City Council)	

Chair

Neil Ritchie (Scottish Government)

Apologies

Graham Applegate, GA (SEPA)	Bruce Kiloh, BK (SPT)
James Curran, JC (Scottish Environment Link)	Martin Marsden, MM (SEPA)
Gillian Dick, GD (Heads of Planning Scotland)	Janice Milne, JM (SEPA)
Colin Gillespie, CG (SEPA)	Yvette Sheppard, YS (Transport Scotland)
Stephen Thomson, ST (Transport Scotland)	

Item	Title	Action
1.	<p><u>Welcome and introductions</u></p> <p>NR made apologies for any last minute disruption caused as a result of switching the meeting to a teleconference. This was partially due to the ECCLR committee scheduled for 31 Oct which a number of CAFS GG members were required to attend. Given the number of apologies, it was agreed the meeting would focus on the KPI and NCAD items on the agenda.</p> <p>KS was welcome as a new member to the CAFS GG, representing Perth and Kinross Council as the local authority voice beyond the ‘4 cities’.</p>	
2.	<p><u>Minutes/actions last meeting</u></p> <p>Outstanding actions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ALL to come back to EP with further suggestions for CAFS GG membership, wider groups we should be linking up with and how, and further suggestions for future meeting topics. EP to draft paper/summary. Draft workplan circulated with papers from previous meeting but no feedback received as yet – request reiterated for input/feedback/suggestions re possible meeting topics. - EP to redraft infographic from Terms of Reference to more accurately reflect current groups and ‘sub-groups’ feeding into 	

	<p>CAFS GG. Draft infographic circulated with papers for this meeting – request reiterated for input/feedback.</p> <p>Action 1: EP to schedule time to discuss CAFS infographic for agreement at next CAFS GG meeting.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - VM to feedback to CAFS GG on likely date for Traffic Commissioner submission, dependent on developments. For inclusion in LEZ dashboard reporting going forward (see item 5). Glasgow now announced as first LEZ for 2018. The first meeting of the Glasgow LEZ delivery group has taken place, co-chaired by Glasgow City Council and Transport Scotland, with discussion re Traffic Commissioner submission ongoing. EH advised FoES are organising a meeting in Glasgow for the local FoES group with Councillor Richardson to discuss the vision for the LEZ in Glasgow. - AT to liaise with Ricardo to update website more frequently. AT confirmed that Ricardo will be able to update the SAQ website with CAFS information e.g. CAFS GG meeting minutes more frequently. <p>Action 2: EP to progress SAQ website CAFS updates further with AT/Ricardo including initial update to main CAFS page.</p>	
<p>3.</p>	<p><u>National Clean Air Day</u></p> <p>LB provided a summary of National Clean Air Day (see also NCAD note circulated prior to meeting), which took place on 15 June 2017. The awareness day was developed by Global Action Plan (GAP) on behalf of Defra, and Scotland’s participation was initiated by Scottish Government, with support from SEPA and the CAFS partners. Key outcomes included good media coverage, social media, a members’ debate in Parliament and engagement with the day by Scottish local authorities and the private sector through workshops and their own comms activities.</p> <p>GAP recommendations included earlier announcement of the date (2018 date now set as 21 June); highlighting the ‘human’ angle, and for the campaign to be underpinned by one call to action with low barriers to entry (i.e. making it easy for a range of organisations to sign up and support the day).</p> <p>If NCAD is to be repeated in 2018 LB proposed that rather than asking organisations to sign up to very specific messaging, that a ‘framework’ approach be adopted via the Scotland-specific part of the NCAD website, with commissioning of a PR agency to develop headline stories, deliver a national event and provide briefing packs and toolkits for NCAD activities. The intended focus for 2018 is on schools, older people and public bodies. It was proposed that funding should be provided by Scottish Government, with contributions from the CAFS partners if desired.</p>	

	<p>The CAFS GG was asked to consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Is NCAD a valuable campaign and are we happy to subscribe to the campaign for 2018 as outlined by GAP? <p>It was felt that NCAD is a useful awareness raising campaign, but that it should not divert resource away from LEZ communications work, or wider public awareness throughout the rest of the year.</p> <p>It was noted that future NCAD campaigns should ensure cross-departmental engagement with the health minister, and emphasise actions people can take to improve air quality via use of active travel and public transport.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Is the proposal of a framework approach agreeable? <p>It was generally felt that a framework approach providing a central place where organisations can interact and promote their own initiatives is preferable to scripting specific messages. This should allow as many organisations as possible to utilise the day without being too prescriptive, but also raise the profile of air quality issues and opportunities to deal with them.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Who is the lead delivery partner to liaise with GAP in delivering NCAD? <p>LB noted that SEPA is unable to provide the lead role for CAFS communications; this was not agreed by the board or Agency Management Team, and the organisation is not able to resource this. If the intention is for SEPA to lead on NCAD, then this still needs to be agreed internally. Given the new landscape with LEZs, discussion is required to see where NCAD would most usefully sit as well as further discussion required round wider CAFS comms landscape.</p> <p>It was noted that Transport Scotland is having discussions around LEZ communication – both local authority-specific and overall support from Transport Scotland.</p> <p>Action 3: Transport Scotland to provide update at next CAFS GG meeting on LEZ comms work.</p> <p>It was proposed that Environmental Protection Scotland (EPS) may be able to take the lead role for liaising with GAP on NCAD, given that they are moving more towards marketing/PR as an organisation, and having recently taken on specific comms and media resource, and given their remit to support Scottish Government.</p> <p>Action 4: AT to speak to EPS to see how NCAD may be delivered.</p>	
4.	<p><u>Development of Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)</u></p> <p>It was suggested that consideration is required to determine KPIs required for CAFS (in addition to reporting on progress with individual actions) and for</p>	

air quality more generally, given that some may be used for attribution, and some for raising awareness of air quality as an issue.

The Scottish Air Quality Indicator (SAQI) project, led by IOM on behalf of Scottish Government was discussed. This project has not concluded yet, although the draft final report has been received; once this has been reviewed, feedback can be provided at the next CAFS GG meeting. It is intended that the SAQI will provide the 'headline' KPI, from which others would stem. It was noted that the SAQI is an 'air quality' rather than 'CAFS' indicator.

Action 5: EP to schedule time for AT and CG to feedback on SAQI report at next CAFS GG meeting.

Interest in developing a sustainable transport index to consider transport contributions and monitor modal shift over time while still maintaining people's ability to travel was expressed, although this would be a significant piece of work.

The need for caution regarding the development of health indicators was highlighted, given the complexity of the relationships between pollution levels and health outcomes. The relationship between excess death rates and PM is relatively well understood and has been quantified with reasonable certainty; however this is not the case for health impacts of NO₂ exposure (the main focus of LEZ initiatives). The Committee on the Medical Effects of Air Pollutants (COMEAP) report on health impacts of NO₂ is expected by the end of 2017 and may help clarify understanding. Metrics such as overall mortality rates vary constantly due to many different factors and cannot be easily or directly correlated with small local changes in pollutant levels. Using simplified health indicators to try to determine the effects of interventions (e.g. introduction of an LEZ in an urban area) may therefore be problematic and may fail to demonstrate any significant associated change.

It was queried what intention there is to develop KPIs to determine LEZ effectiveness. A monitoring and evaluation plan for LEZs is required to determine outcomes. Pilot studies in progress (being overseen by the Air Pollution and Health subgroup of the Scottish Health Protection Network) using recent Scottish pollution and health data may provide additional evidence to support health impact evaluation of LEZs. Further consideration of what might represent useful health related indicators in relation to CAFS will be required.

The need for a focus on outcome indicators (i.e. those that show progress against deliverables) was noted, as was the need to ensure awareness of the significant amount of data already available which could be packaged into indicators. The need to consider and clearly communicate any potential additional reporting requirements for local authorities was also stated.

	Action 6: AT and CG to develop draft Terms of Reference for agreement by the CAFS GG for a CAFS sub group to progress the development of KPIs.	
5.	<u>AOB</u> LEZ update dashboard circulated with papers for this meeting. Transport Scotland are seeking feedback on the format and level of detail provided. Action 7: ALL to provide feedback to YS on LEZ dashboard.	
6.	<u>Thanks and close</u>	