

## Meeting Minutes for Cleaner Air for Scotland Governance Group

**Location:** Glasgow City Chambers, George Square, Glasgow  
**Date:** 11 Dec 2017  
**Time:** 10:00 – 13:00

### Present

Graham Applegate (SEPA)	Eleanor Pratt (SEPA)
Dom Callaghan (Glasgow City Council)	Colin Ramsay (HPS)
Shauna Clarke (City of Edinburgh Council)	Neil Ritchie (Scottish Government)
Gillian Dick (Heads of Planning Scotland)	Yvette Sheppard (Transport Scotland)
Colin Gillespie (SEPA/NMF)	Kirsty Steven (Perth and Kinross Council)
Emilia Hanna (Scottish Environment Link)	Andrew Taylor (Scottish Government)
Drew Hill (Transport Scotland)	Iris Whyte (Dundee City Council)
Janice Milne (SEPA)	

### Chair

Neil Ritchie (Scottish Government)

### Additional Attendees

Andrea Mackie (City of Edinburgh Council)  
 Emma Whorlow (Transport Scotland)

### Apologies

Aileen Brodie (Aberdeen City Council)	Bruce Kiloh (SPT)
Lorna Bryce (SEPA)	Martin Marsden (SEPA)
James Curran (Scottish Environment Link)	Vincent McNally (Glasgow City Council)
David Kernohan (SG Health Protection)	Stephen Thomson (Transport Scotland)

tem	Title	Action
1.	<p><b><u>Welcome/Introduction</u></b></p> <p>NR welcomed everyone to the December meeting. Additional attendees included Emma Whorlow, new briefings and correspondence officer for Transport Scotland, and Andrea Mackie, transport officer for City of Edinburgh Council, who were observing.</p> <p>NR advised that the Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform (ECCLR) committee had held the final evidence session of the air quality inquiry last week and that findings/response would be published in the new year.</p> <p>The Minister for Transport and the Islands had also given a parliamentary statement on Low Emission Zones (LEZs) following the closure of the LEZ consultation on 28 November.</p> <p>On Thursday 14 December, Derek Mackay will present the Scottish Budget to parliament.</p>	
2.	<p><b><u>Minutes/Actions from Last Meeting</u></b></p> <p>Outstanding actions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>ALL to come back to EP with further suggestions for CAFS GG membership, wider groups etc:</b> Stephen Thomson is exploring the possibility of Federation of Small Business and City of Commerce members attending future CAFS meetings.</li> <li>- <b>EP to redraft infographic from Terms of Reference to more accurately reflect current groups and ‘sub-groups’ feeding into CAFS GG:</b> Draft circulated with papers for this meeting; ALL given final deadline of 12 Jan to provide final comment (see action under item 3).</li> </ul>	<p><b>ALL</b></p> <p><b>EP</b></p>

	<p>- <b>EP to progress SAQ website CAFS updates further with AT/Ricardo, including initial update to main CAFS page:</b> YS to provide content on LEZs to EP by 12 Jan 2018. EP to ensure Ricardo update page by end Jan 2018.</p>	EP/YS
3.	<p><b><u>CAFS Infographic</u></b></p> <p>It was noted that some of the detail in each of the boxes isn't yet final, but that any final comments on the format, structure and lines of reporting would be appreciated, to allow for inclusion of the diagram on the CAFS page of the Scottish Air Quality website.</p> <p><b>Action 1: ALL to provide any final comment on the CAFS infographic by 12 Jan 2018.</b></p>	ALL
4.	<p><b><u>CAFS Key Performance Indicators</u></b></p> <p>CG and AT advised that the outputs from the final IOM report on the Scottish Air Quality Indicator (SAQI) project aren't currently sufficient to develop an air quality indicator (based on a bundle of pollutants, rather than individual pollutants currently monitored for) as originally hoped. What has been produced is a loose set of indicators for human health, but not at a sufficiently local level. A meeting is being set up to determine what else is required to progress towards indicator development. Input from CR to be sought.</p> <p>Work to develop Key Performance Indicators (KPI) for CAFS has been overtaken by other priorities, but draft Terms of Reference and potential membership of a KPI working group will be developed for the January CAFS meeting. This working group will likely cover further progression for the SAQI, CAFS KPIs, and further monitoring/evaluation requirements. Health indicators in relation to LEZs were raised at the last meeting – this has potential to be considered at both local LEZ Delivery Group level, and national KPI working group level, to allow consistency. It was noted that indicators should be supportive of CAFS delivery, rather than turning into significant pieces of work in their own right.</p> <p><b>Action 2: AT and CG to draft ToRs and consider potential membership for KPI subgroup in advance of CAFS GG meeting on 24 Jan 2018.</b></p>	AT/CG
5.	<p><b><u>CAFS Communications</u></b></p> <p><b><u>LEZ Comms</u></b></p> <p>An update had been requested from Transport Scotland regarding plans for LEZ communications. Specific requests included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Clarity around the finer detail of LEZs (e.g. details of what vehicles are likely to be affected when) to head off more sensationalist headlines – ‘war on motorists’ etc. This detail is for local authorities to determine, but the message could be clearer nationally that private vehicles are not being targeted immediately.</li> <li>- Clarity on roles/responsibilities - what elements of LEZs will be consistent nationally and what will be up to individual local authorities.</li> <li>- Continued positive national messaging around the need for and benefits of LEZs, whilst also acknowledging action beyond LEZs is required, integrating messages around public transport, modal shift, behaviour change etc. so that LEZs are not seen in isolation</li> </ul> <p>YS stated that LEZ campaign communications are being discussed at the local LEZ delivery groups (which will include communications professionals), which will work together with national messages (including media/press comms from Transport Scotland) for consistency. It will be critical to establish key milestones for when national-level comms on LEZs are required. The first of these will be publication of the LEZ consultation report at the end of Jan 2018. It was acknowledged that further information on roles and responsibilities is required, and that</p>	

	<p>there is a need for further information around the Programme for Government commitment to LEZs in AQMAs beyond the 4 cities where NLEF shows this to be appropriate.</p> <p>EH offered to make information about Friends of the Earth Scotland’s comms/campaign plans available if this is seen to be helpful and appropriate – happy to discuss outside of the meeting.</p> <p><u>Wider CAFS Comms</u></p> <p>Discussions have been held with Environmental Protection Scotland (EPS) to take on work round CAFS and air quality comms. EPS has a new policy/communications officer starting in January, who has strong media experience. This will provide expertise and resource for wider CAFS and air quality messages, with scope to deliver more ‘campaign-type’ comms (e.g. through EPS’ Breathe Scotland initiative).</p> <p><b>Action 3: New EPS officer to be invited to future CAFS GG meeting.</b></p>	EP
6.	<p><b><u>Next Steps for National Low Emission Framework (NLEF)</u></b></p> <p>It was acknowledged that the NLEF appraisal guidance that has been produced needs to be reviewed and sense checked to ensure it is fit for purpose in light of the Programme for Government commitments to LEZs (including LEZ assessment across all AQMAs), and to take account of the LEZ consultation responses. The preference is to produce one document which takes account of all of these updated commitments, and which can also be informed by the Glasgow LEZ, rather than two versions of the document. It was suggested that once NLEF had been revised that the guidance also be run past a ‘non-LEZ’ local authority to check it is workable for both types of authorities.</p> <p><b>Action 4: YS to produce a draft timeline for review/update of NLEF for next CAFS GG meeting on 24 Jan.</b></p> <p>It was queried whether NLEF will cover how to anticipate and mitigate potential negative impacts of LEZs. YS acknowledged that these elements could be flagged more in the guidance, and useful tools to identify mitigation measures (such as the Place Standard) identified.</p>	YS
7.	<p><b><u>CAFS Actions Not Covered Under Existing Workstreams</u></b></p> <p>EP stated that she will be seeking contributions to the next CAFS Annual Progress report early in the new year.</p> <p><b>Action 5: EP to circulate timescale for CAFS progress report contributions by next CAFS GG meeting on 24 Jan 2018.</b></p> <p>There are currently four CAFS actions which are not being captured under existing CAFS or associated workstreams.</p> <p><u>T1 (All local authorities should ensure that they have a corporate travel plan (perhaps within a carbon management plan) which is consistent with any local air quality action plan) and CC2 (Expect any Scottish local authority which has or is currently developing a Sustainable Energy Action Plan to ensure that air quality considerations are covered):</u> The LAQM annual reporting template was updated this year to allow local authorities to report any progress on these actions. SEPA will now begin to review these reports to determine what level of information is being provided, and from which local authorities.</p>	EP

	<p><u>LP9 (Implement the national databases for traffic data collection and local modelling outputs associated with CAFS) and T15 (Trunk road impacts on AQMAs will be reviewed, and implement mitigation where trunk roads are the primary contributor to air pollutants):</u> Transport Scotland will update on these at the next meeting if required.</p>	
	<p><b>AOCB</b></p> <p>Queries were raised around the LEZ governance structure, and the remits of the various groups. YS noted that draft terms of reference were issued to the nominated representatives of the ministerially-led LEZ Leadership group, and will be discussed when the group meets for the first time this week. These will be circulated to the CAFS GG for information once confirmed.</p> <p>The 4-cities LEZ Consistency group which will enable collective discussion on LEZs will meet early in the new year and will include representatives from each of the 4 city authorities, Transport Scotland, SEPA, and possibly others involved in the delivery of LEZs.</p> <p>It was queried how the consistency group will relate back to NLEF, and decisions on national vs locally-led processes for LEZs. YS responded that this will be decided collectively in collaboration with the 4-city local authorities.</p> <p><b>Action 6: YS to draft key points document to provide clarity on flow of information and reporting mechanisms between the LEZ City Delivery Groups, Consistency Group and Leadership Group for next CAFS GG meeting on 24 Jan 2018.</b></p>	<p>YS</p>