Meeting Minutes for Cleaner Air for Scotland Governance Group

Location: SEPA, Strathallan House, Castle Business Park, Stirling
Date: 8 June 2018
Time: 10:00 – 13:00

Present
Aileen Brodie (Aberdeen City Council), AB
Donald McGillivray (Scottish Government), DM
John Bynorth (Environmental Protection Scotland), JB
Vincent McInally (Glasgow City Council), VM
Shauna Clarke (City of Edinburgh Council), SC
Janice Milne (SEPA), JM
Campbell Gemmell, CGe
Eleanor Pratt (SEPA), EP
Colin Gillespie (SEPA/NMF), CGi
Yvette Sheppard (Transport Scotland), YS
Daniel Jones (British Heart Foundation), DJ
Andrew Taylor (Scottish Government), AT
Jamie Landwehr (Dundee City Council), JL

Chair
Donald McGillivray (Scottish Government)

Apologies
Gillian Dick (Heads of Planning Scotland)
Colin Ramsay (Health Protection Scotland)
Bruce Kiloh (SPT)
Kirsty Steven (Perth and Kinross Council)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Welcome/Introductions</td>
<td>DM opened the meeting, introducing himself as deputy director of Environmental Quality at Scottish Government, and welcomed two additional new members – Daniel Jones, policy and public affairs officer at the British Heart Foundation, and Professor Campbell Gemmell.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Minutes/Actions from Last Meeting</td>
<td>Minute agreed. EP still seeking Transport Scotland and Scottish Government representatives for the CAFS Placemaking subgroup – will follow up separately.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 3.   | Update from Scottish Government | - Scottish Government has responded to the Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform (ECCLR) committee’s air quality inquiry report.  
- This includes a commitment to a full review of CAFS by the end of 2020. This review will cover both existing CAFS actions and new actions required. The review will also consider policy areas not currently covered in the strategy, particularly agriculture and domestic combustion.  
- The need to ensure focus is maintained on delivering current CAFS actions, particularly those around Placemaking and Communication was highlighted.  
- It is intended that the cross-organisational collaborative approach used when drafting CAFS will continue for the review process.  
- This also provides a good opportunity to review how the CAFS Governance Group (CAFS GG) itself functions - new members will be required to cover any additional policy areas, chair arrangements should be reviewed, and strategic-level meetings implemented.  
Action 1: ALL to provide thoughts/suggestions on CAFS GG structure/membership/CAFS review to DG or EP.  
Action 2: AT and EP to draft timeline/high level plan for CAFS review and circulate prior to next meeting on 12 Sep.  
- Defra has published its draft Clean Air Strategy for consultation, which includes proposals for agriculture and domestic biomass. These proposals will be considered during the review of CAFS. The consultation closes on 14 August 2018. |

ALL  AT/EP
- It was noted that the draft Defra Clean Air Strategy proposes a possible review of the Clean Air Act 1993. Scottish Government will keep the strategy under review, and if resulting new policy requires new legislation to be implemented, then this will be considered.

4. **Sub-Group Updates**

An update was provided from each of the sub-group leads.

**Key Performance Indicators (KPIs):**

- The Scottish Air Quality Index (SAQI) project final report has been received, but identified a number of issues and recommendations which require further consideration. Scottish Government and SEPA will progress work further with the University of Glasgow, with completion of the SAQI project planned for the first half of 2019.
- The first meeting of the CAFS KPI subgroup has also taken place, which will develop KPIs and reporting methods associated with the delivery of CAFS actions.

**National Modelling Framework (NMF):**

**Regional Model:**

- The NMF regional model approach has been developed, based on the Dutch model. This is currently using data extrapolated from Scotland’s noise maps, due to the absence of consistent high quality regional traffic data.
- The approach has however been tested using high quality traffic data collected as part of the Glasgow local NMF process, and it performed well. A similar level of data for LAs beyond the four cities is now required in order to roll the regional model out further. In the absence of a centralised traffic data collection programme covering local roads as well as trunk roads, this is being requested direct from LAs by SEPA.
- The importance of engaging with SCOTS and RTPs on this issue to sell the benefits of and get buy in to the regional modelling approach was noted.

**City Models:**

- The NMF detailed city model work has been focussed on Glasgow and Edinburgh due to LEZ commitments for 2018/19.
- The models for Aberdeen and Dundee are less mature, and need to be progressed further to support LEZ implementation by 2020 as per the Programme for Government (PfG) commitment. Now that traffic data for these locations has been received, the NMF team is being redistributed to focus work on Dundee and Aberdeen, to align with timescales for feeding into committee meetings and supporting LEZ decision making. Clarification on these timescales was requested.

Detailed updates on each of the NMF actions can be found in the NMF update circulated prior to the meeting. It was noted that a higher level summary of this work would be useful, as the current updated provided is very technical in nature.

**Action 3: CG to provide high-level headline NMF update for future CAFS GG meetings, summarising timeline and key issues for each model (including key dates for committees, links with transport model development etc.).**
**National Low Emission Framework (NLEF)**

- The NLEF guidance drafted last year is being updated to take account of the PfG commitment to LEZs in all AQMAs by 2023, where the NLEF shows this to be appropriate.
- A revised approach has been developed which embeds consideration of vehicle access restrictions in the context of the existing Local Air Quality Management (LAQM) regime. This approach has been presented to local authority Local Pollution Control Liaison Groups, and a redrafted version of the guidance will be shared with them prior to publication in Sep 2018, depending on statutory requirements.
- The need to ensure SCOTS and RTPs are tied into this engagement process was noted.

**Update on Low Emission Zones (LEZs)** (N.B. LEZs are being managed under a separate LEZ Governance structure, to reflect that LEZs are a Programme for Government commitment, rather than an action under CAFS).

- The [Transport (Scotland) Bill](#) is due to be laid in parliament shortly and includes high-level provisions for LEZs. More specific elements e.g. exemptions will be included in supporting secondary legislation. Input from the 4-city LEZ consistency group will be sought on this.

**Glasgow:**

- The LEZ Delivery Group continues to meet on a monthly basis.
- The City Administration Committee will consider LEZ proposals on 14 June, including implementation timelines, impacts on business etc.
- A submission to the Traffic Commissioner for Scotland was made in April in relation to bus operations to support the first phase of the LEZ.
- NMF modelling for the second phase (all vehicles) requires a finalised transport model to support the air quality model and to determine impacts of restrictions on other vehicle types and likely compliance timescales. Development of the transport model is being led by Glasgow City Council with consultant support – further information on timelines will be available at the next CAFS meeting.

**Edinburgh:**

- An LEZ Delivery Group is in place, and meeting regularly.
- A LEZ paper was submitted to committee in May, which confirmed the commitment to an LEZ by the end of 2019, with initial proposals for geographic areas to be covered.
- The next report in August will initiate a joint wider public consultation on Edinburgh’s transport strategy and Transforming Edinburgh City Centre strategy.
- Traffic modelling also initiated in conjunction with these projects.
- Initial NMF report due, which will include the evidence base from the NMF model/scenario testing, which will ultimately assist in the development of a phasing timetable.

**Dundee/Aberdeen:**

- The NMF city model work will continue to be progressed to ensure evidence is available to support LEZ design/delivery within the PfG timescale. Timelines to be included in high-level NMF summary (see Action 3).
Funding:

- The Bus Emission Abatement Retrofit (BEAR) scheme Phase 1 funds have been awarded, mainly to support operators in Glasgow. Discussion around state aid issue ongoing.
- Phase 2 of the fund is planned for Aug 2018. Need for early communication on this funding programme with bus operators in other cities was noted.

LEZ Communications:

- Transport Scotland have engaged the BIG Partnership to develop a national LEZ communications plan and website, including a vehicle registration tracker. All CAFS partners are listed as key stakeholders and will be contacted. Programme forthcoming.
- The need to ensure clear links with the CAFS Communications subgroup to ensure a coordinated approach and links to the Scottish Air Quality website was noted.

Placemaking:

- The first meeting of the CAFS Placemaking subgroup will take place next month. Membership will include the chair of the Placemaking subgroup of the Key Agencies Group feeding into the Planning review.
- The trial of the air quality-focussed ‘technical version’ of the Place Standard tool commences this month with workshops in Edinburgh, Glasgow and Crieff being organised between now and September, to trial use of the tool in a variety of air quality contexts including LAQM action planning and LEZ engagement. The trial is being coordinated by Planning Aid Scotland (PAS). The technical version of the tool will also be included in a mobile version of the Glasgow Science Centre CAFS exhibit.
- The air quality training package for planners is now in the final stages of development by SEPA. The training has been delivered to SEPA planners and PAS volunteers, and a delivery plan for roll out to local authority transport and land-use planners is being developed.

Communications:

- Planning for Clean Air Day (CAD) has been the main focus for Environmental Protection Scotland. A formal meeting of the Communications sub-group group will take place shortly. The group will consider how best to ensure CAD delivers beyond ‘one day’. British Heart Foundation’s experience developing joint campaigns with Scottish Government will be a valuable addition to the group.

5. Public Engagement/Communications Opportunities – Next Quarter

It was noted that this will be a standing item on future agendas, to support the work of the CAFS Communications subgroup.

Action 4: ALL members to give consideration to upcoming public engagement or communications opportunities within their organisations which can be used to highlight CAFS/air quality messaging.

Clean Air Day 21 June:
A variety of activities are planned across Scotland, including large events in Glasgow and Edinburgh, supported by a coordinated social media campaign with buy-in from a number of celebrities. An evaluation report of the day will be provided.
CAFS Mobile Exhibit:
SEPA is working with the Glasgow Science Centre to develop a mobile version of the CAFS exhibit launched there last year. Initial funding has been received to allow the exhibit to be located in the four cities that are currently undertaking LEZ assessments. Beyond this, it is intended that the mobile exhibit will be made available for each of the LAs that have Air Quality Management Areas (AQMAs) to promote local improvement measures.

British Heart Foundation Centre of Excellence Visit:
DJ proposed a joint ministerial visit to the BHF’s research centre to highlight the good work the Scottish Government is doing on air quality. Ideally this would be a joint visit by the Minister for Public Health and Sport, the Minister for Transport and the Islands, and the Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform, although it was acknowledged that diaries may be difficult to coordinate.

**Action 5: Invitations for BHF Centre of Excellent visit to be extended by DJ.**

6. **CAFS Progress Report**
   - The CAFS 2017/18 Annual Progress Report is now being finalised, with publication intended within the next few weeks depending on ministerial/cab sec sign off.
   - This is a consolidated report with contributions from various authors across the CAFS policy streams, covering the period from Jan 2017 to March 2018.
   - As per the recommendations made by the ECCLR committee as part of their air quality inquiry, the 2017/18 CAFS progress report will list each of the CAFS actions separately, and indicate progress against each one using a Red/Amber/Green (RAG) status.
   - A number of actions are currently ‘red’; in many cases this is as a result of significant shifts to the wider policy environment around air quality, including the ongoing reviews of the National Transport Strategy, and the Planning review. Where necessary revised periods for completion have been included in the report.
   - A number of the completed actions would benefit from next steps, particularly those in the Climate Change section. Others would benefit from being split out into different workstreams to make reporting clearer. The CAFS Review is an excellent opportunity to do this.
   - The final report will be circulated when available.

7. **AOB**
   DM restated the need for a review of the CAFS governance structure to support the CAFS review and strategic level engagement. See Action 1 under item 3.

8. **Next Meeting** – Weds 12 September. Location TBC – likely Dundee.