

## Meeting Minutes for Cleaner Air for Scotland Governance Group

**Location:** Transport Scotland, Buchanan House, 58 Port Dundas Road, Glasgow, G4 0HF  
**Date:** 10 June 2016  
**Time:** 10:00 – 13:00

### Present

Graham Applegate, GA (SEPA)	Vincent McNally, VM (Glasgow City Council)
Aileen Brodie, AB (Aberdeen City Council)	Janice Milne, JM (SEPA)
Janet Brown, JB (City of Edinburgh Council)	Eleanor Pratt, EP (SEPA/TS)
Lorna Bryce, LB (SEPA)	Neil Ritchie, NR (Scottish Government)
Colin Gillespie, CG (SEPA)	Andrew Taylor, AT (Scottish Government)
Emilia Hanna, EH (Scottish Environment Link)	Stephen Thomson, ST (Transport Scotland)
Drew Hill, DH (Transport Scotland)	Iris Whyte, IW (Dundee City Council)
Martin Marsden, MM (SEPA)	

### Chair

Stephen Thomson (Transport Scotland)

### Apologies

James Curran, JC (Scottish Environment Link)  
 Gillian Dick, GD (Heads of Planning Scotland)  
 Bruce Kiloh, BK (SPT)  
 Denise McCann, DM (SG Health Protection)  
 Colin Ramsay, CR (Health Protection Scotland)

Item	Title	Action
1.	<p><b><u>Welcome and introductions</u></b></p> <p>ST welcomed Transport Scotland colleagues dialling in from Victoria Quay, Edinburgh:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Zac Tuck, ZT (Low Carbon Vehicles Policy Team)</li> <li>- Joanne Gray, JG (Regional Transport Policy Team)</li> <li>- Tom Davy, TD (Bus and Local Transport Policy)</li> <li>- Karen Furey, KF (Cycling Policy Manager)</li> </ul>	
2.	<p><b><u>Transport Scotland policy leads CAFS discussion</u></b></p> <p>It is acknowledged in CAFS that transport is a significant contributor to poor air quality. A number of the CAFS Transport actions are being progressed under existing policy streams within Transport Scotland (TS). The aim of asking the various TS policy leads to dial into the meeting was to establish what is currently being done on these actions, how the CAFS GG can best support/liaise on this work, and to understand where air quality considerations fit. It was highlighted that there was no expectation to get all these answers today, but to open a door to discussions.</p> <p>Other aims from around the table included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Greater understanding of how TS prioritise funds, especially any</li> </ul>	

geographical priorities, given that the CAFS work may require priority to be given to areas with the worst air quality.

- The suggestion that a sustainable transport index could be developed to illustrate air quality and sustainable transport improvements while also ensuring transport delivery is sustained.
- Better understanding of the Scottish Government policy framework and connections with what TS do.

An overview of progress on CAFS Transport actions was provided from the TS policy leads, with particular emphasis on those transport actions previously prioritised by the CAFS GG – T3, T4, T7, T14. For further detail see Transport policy leads update attached to papers:

CAFS action T3 (We will work with partners to deliver our shared vision in the Cycling Action Plan for Scotland that by 2020, 10% of everyday journeys will be made by bike): Karen Furey - currently awaiting a progress report on the Cycling Action Plan (CAP) 2013 from Cycling Scotland. A new CAP will then be developed by the end of 2016, in consultation with stakeholders. The CAPS delivery forum will meet on 21 June 2016. KF is seeking input on how to reach the 10% vision, and what actions in the CAPS should be taken forward or scrapped. CAPS focusses on people - encouraging those who wouldn't normally use bikes to use them for everyday journeys. £40million is currently being invested in cycling, most match -funded.

It was highlighted that some of the CAFS actions in the priority cities may result in restricting vehicle access, which may create a demand for cycling – we should consider how to build on that synergy.

It was queried whether there is a marketing plan in place to roll CAPS out? This will be done by TS in conjunction with Sustrans and Cycling Scotland, but communications will focus on 'delivery', rather than rolling out the document itself. This may be relevant to the work of the CAFS Comms group.

CAFS action T4 (Review support for green buses by 2016 including scope for supporting retrofitting existing vehicles taking account of technological and market developments and the need to tackle air quality as well as climate change) and CAFS action T5 (Evaluate the Bus Investment Fund in 2016 to learn from supported projects and inform decisions on options for future support for local projects to improve public transport): Tom Davy - Currently engaging with new Transport minister on bus issues, which is 'helped' by bad news stories regarding bus service issues. Also working with Low Carbon Vehicle Partnership (Low CVP) to review available technologies and costs for low emission buses relative to both carbon and air quality. Reviewing technical issues and usability barriers etc. Once this is done Transport Scotland will seek to discuss options with a wider range of stakeholders.

CAFS action T6 (The Bus Operators Grant will be reviewed by 2016 including options to incentivise the use of low emission buses): Tom Davy - Currently engaging with operating companies to discuss reducing rates, and what the

grant is for (i.e. subsidising the bus network and services). The grant is under financial strain - if more money is invested in low carbon vehicles, this means less money is spent on the network generally, which can be difficult for rural areas. TD's team are making the case for at least maintaining the budget, but future funding is dependent on spending review etc.

Discussions are ongoing about whether to remain technologically 'neutral' and prioritise the numbers of buses, or whether to focus on more 'difficult' new technologies which need help to break into the market, but which may result in less buses being available overall. Another alternative is to pay for the retrofitting of existing vehicles, which may be a more cost efficient method to result in air quality improvements. Currently the fund does not support infrastructure - many of the new technologies have infrastructure requirements which have to be borne by either operators or LAs.

It was highlighted by the GG that potential LEZs may focus on buses, complementing this work and providing a potential demand for retrofitting funding etc. It was suggested that funding for the Bus Investment Fund, Green Bus Fund and Bus Operators Grant could be rolled out together with funding for LEZs etc., which could provide the 'carrot' to that LEZ 'stick' and help focus operators on air quality emissions as well as carbon. TD responded that one idea around the GBF and BSOG is to look at retrofit bus standards using LEZs as the incentive. Previously the Bus Investment Fund paid for various different types of intervention, this is being reviewed, and funding may be focussed on specific measures instead. TD is also liaising with ZT's team regarding the potential for mix/match funding.

CAFS action T14 (Review existing Ministerial guidance on Regional and Local Transport Strategies during 2016 in light of the refreshed National Transport Strategy, to consider air quality management and supporting modal shift towards sustainable and active travel): Tom Davy/Joanne Gray – The National Transport Strategy (NTS) refresh has been a driver for this action. Work has not started yet, but workshops will be held; invites still to be issued. Air quality is considered by Transport Scotland to be a key driver.

Regional Transport Strategies are mandatory documents produced by Regional Transport Partnerships (RTPs), agreed by ministers and with regard to TS guidance, however they are not prescriptive and are quite high-level. While the language can be improved and guidance updated, they are quite a 'light lever' to set the right tone, with the Local Transport Strategies underneath potentially being more relevant to air quality improvements, although these are not mandatory. The review of the guidance under this action would not look at making local strategies statutory, as this would be too prescriptive an action from central government to local authorities.

It was highlighted by the CAFS GG LA representatives that non-mandatory work in LAs does not currently get sufficient resource; the focus is very much on statutory functions. The Local Transport Strategies have been found to be a useful means to pull together different areas of the LA, but could have

significantly more impact were they to be made mandatory.

It was also suggested that the review of the guidance could consider Sustainable Urban Mobility Plans (SUMPs) which have funding attached and are good at focussing transport on air quality solutions.

CAFS action T8 (Continue delivery of actions contained in Switched on Scotland: A Roadmap to Widespread Adoption of Plug-in Vehicle): Zac Tuck - Switched on Scotland has an aim for transport in Scotland to be carbon-free by 2050. Greenhouse gases, air quality, renewable energy and economic opportunity are the 4 pillars of this work. The Roadmap itself has 37 actions. The 'Switched on Fleets' work has approached all Community Planning Partnerships (CPPs) with advice on introducing electric vehicles (EVs) into fleets, and worked with public sector bodies to introduce funded EVs. ZT's team also leads on the Charge Place Scotland Network: 550 charge points are in place and funding is provided to CPPs for them to continue developing this network. The low interest loan scheme has been re-opened this week, with £7 million available this year – open to public/taxis/other businesses for zero interest loans to buy Low Emission Vehicles (LEVs).

CAFS action T9 (Review the Roadmap and develop a post-2015 plug-in vehicle action plan): Zac Tuck – Currently reviewing progress, such as numbers of EVs in place. Also contributing to other policy areas e.g. input to CAFS transport group etc. A light-touch, rather than full, consultation will take place over summer/early autumn. Will host Ecosse workshops to get views and perhaps conduct an online survey. Output will be a concise document with progress to date and a new action plan for between present and 2020 to increase uptake of LEVs. Also scoping a Switched On Cities idea – how to encourage cities to introduce local incentives e.g. reducing parking, opening up bus lanes to EVs, planning measures and Local Development Plans, taxi licensing arrangements etc. Want to create a funding scheme in Scotland at the start of the next financial year to work with cities on these elements.

CAFS action T10 (Work with key partners to investigate the use of hydrogen as a transport fuel, as well as exploring wider environmental and economic opportunities of using hydrogen for energy applications): Zac Tuck – This action is being progressed by a team including representatives from Scottish Government Energy, Scottish Hydrogen Fuel Cell Association, Scottish Enterprise and Transport Scotland. A 'Roadmap for Hydrogen' is being developed by Innovate UK, looking at the role of hydrogen in energy, heat, and transport fuel. Over the next couple of months recommendations will be made for what to focus on in Scotland – infrastructure requirements etc. Aberdeen is illustrating a hydrogen focus, as well as Fife which has a hydrogen fuelled refuse vehicle, and is hosting the Bright Green Hydrogen project at Levenmouth.

	<p><u>CAFS action T11 (Continue to engage with our partners on the role less carbon intensive fuels such as liquid petroleum gas, compressed natural gas and biofuels can play in the transition to a near zero emission road transport sector by 20150):</u> Zac Tuck – Considering gas fuel, compressed natural gas (CNG), liquid natural gas (LNG) etc. which are good for air quality, but unproven for greenhouse gas benefits. Ongoing research is required to decide if these options are worth pursuing – probably yes for freight. A gas vehicles workshop was conducted recently with the Low Carbon Vehicle Partnership (LowCVP). Trying to investigate and back as many technologies as possible, which fits with the ministerial approach of being technology-agnostic.</p> <p>£65m (some match funded) of European Regional Development Fund (ERDF) funding is available via the TS low carbon travel and transport programme to fund active and low carbon vehicle refuelling hubs. Working on developing a challenge fund for this to go live by the end of 2016 after consulting with stakeholders about what they wish to do e.g. more refuelling infrastructure, active travel support etc. An open invitation for a presentation on the ERDF funding was made, and ZT is happy to attend future meeting to explain progress.</p> <p>The CAFS GG queried whether there was any potential to prioritise grant provision within the Switched on Cities programme, which aligns strongly with CAFS and particularly the NLEF, to urban areas with air quality issues? This may be something to consider, if the funding is available.</p> <p>Engagement with existing manufactures (BMW, Tesla etc.) who are developing their own networks was raised – how to align with them in the future if government funding runs out? ZT’s team have formed close links with these manufacturers, although cessation of funding is still quite far off as many of these technologies are not yet commercially viable. SSE and power companies might have an interest in managing these networks, rather than public sector (TS) - need to make sure funding is invested appropriately.</p> <p>ST thanked the TS policy leads for their updates and input. The need to plan CAFS GG meeting topics ahead of time to allow sufficient time for policy leads to feed in was highlighted.</p> <p><b>Action 1: EP to develop timeline of CAFS GG meetings and topics for next 12 months.</b></p> <p><b>Action 2: EP/DH to develop timetable of key points for engagement between CAFS GG and TS policy leads - see also Action 7 under AOB.</b></p>	<p>EP</p> <p>EP/DH</p>
<p><b>3.</b></p>	<p><b><u>NLEF Update (DH)</u></b></p> <p>An NLEF delivery programme has been drafted and paper copies were discussed at the meeting. As part of engaging and aligning with other approaches, DH has provided comment on Transport for Greater Manchester’s (TfGM) Low Emission Strategy and Air Quality Action Plan. These were well received and TfGM have met with TS and discussed</p>	

collaboration and NLEF input. TfGM have around £100k to develop their LEZ proposal – findings from this could be available as they develop. DH noted TS are developing a business case for the delivery of NLEF options, to include a transport led funding bid. DH and ST also intend to meet with heads of planning and transport in each major city to foster greater understanding of and engagement with the NLEF process.

The NLEF programme currently has 6 headings:

1. Support Services

The consultant brief will be updated and issued for tender, and will include development of 7 work packages requiring support services from the consultant:

- Objectives/Aims/Roles/Responsibilities
- Assessment procedure criteria and measures
- Mitigation options, emission criteria and measures
- Enforcement
- Funding and costs
- Legislation
- Cost benefit analysis tool

2. Guidance Documents

DH is currently preparing background documents on what NLEF options are currently being delivered within LAQM. The above work packages will feed into the development of the NLEF guidance documents which will be prepared by DH and others for review by the NLEF Steering Group.

3. Steering Group

The NLEF Steering Group had its first meeting last week, with monthly progress meetings scheduled. This group will be involved in the NLEF pre-appraisal review process to evaluate which areas should undertake the NLEF process, based on the evidence from modelling. This will be followed by the Stage 1 Gateway review (reviewing/seeking funding required) and Stage 2 Gateway review (detailed design).

4. Delivery Groups

Delivery groups will be set up to conduct the pre-appraisal, Stage 1 and 2 assessment processes (to be reviewed by the overall NLEF steering group), determine measures, and lead implementation. These delivery groups will include LA representatives and others, particularly organisations/groups that may be able to provide funding/support etc.

5. Integration with NMF and UK Approaches

Meetings to be set up with NMF leads, as well as TfGM, DEFRA, DfT and Highways England. The intention is not to replicate the UK process, but there is a need to remain on-side and aware of this approach. It was noted that DEFRA/DfT have engaged Jacobs to take forward their work on LEZ appraisal.

## 6. Other Events

Other events to be aware of include the STEP conference (3<sup>rd</sup> November 2016), which is a key date to allow the minister to demonstrate progress made; Scottish local government elections and the QCumber work.

Red points on the programme indicate key points to maintain progress:

- Issue consultant brief for tender by end of June.
- Steering group to review responses and award work by end July.
- Establish delivery groups by start of October – will require CAFS GG and STEP to disseminate information. DH and ST to engage with transport and planning heads in LAs.
- Public commitment to proceed with an NLEF-based scheme (LEZ or other) by end Sep 2017. By this stage one of the delivery groups will have been through Stage 1, with enough evidence to seek funding to progress a scheme.

Currently the NLEF Steering Group consists of representatives from Glasgow City Council, Aberdeen City Council, SESTran and Transport Scotland. Terms of Reference will be developed, and wider membership considered as the group progress with the workload and areas to be developed.

It was highlighted that there was no SEPA/SG representation at this meeting. DH noted that continuous feedback will be provided, and there will be scope for CAFS GG representatives to attend steering group meetings as required as the group matures, but that the bulk of the group membership should be made up of those who have technical expertise and who can help establish local delivery groups. The close links required with the NMF were emphasised – these will be maintained with continuous discussion between the workstream leads, and joint programme coordination.

**Action 3: DH to issue NLEF steering group minutes/terms of reference to CAFS GG via EP when available.**

DH/EP

**Action 4: ST/DH to issue calendar of subsequent NLEF steering group meetings to inform CAFS GG members when these will take place.**

ST/DH

Next steps (ST/DH):

- Consider representatives from the 4 major cities, Scottish Government Planning (with a SPP focus) and/or HOPS, and potentially academia. There may also be potential roles for chartered institutes e.g. CIHT; transport industry groups e.g. SMMT and business elements e.g. Chamber of Commerce.
- An update note to the transport minister will be produced.

It was suggested that the public commitment to proceed could be brought forward, due to the SNP's commitment to an LEZ in their manifesto. However it was noted that this is difficult until we know what form that LEZ may take, and that there is a need for a stepped approach to announcements to ensure

	<p>not to overstimulate people unnecessarily, and make sure messages deliver maximum value to the work.</p> <p>It was noted that communications around the NLEF and understanding what resources will be required to deliver these messages forms a huge piece of work, which the Comms group cannot deliver alone. There is the intention to engage Sniffer to scope out additional requirements around comms and engagement on the NLEF.</p> <p>It was suggested that key communications points, and key LAQM points (e.g. reporting deadlines) be added into the NLEF programme.</p>	
4.	<p><b><u>NMF Update (CG)</u></b></p> <p><u>CAFS Action C1 ( A Scottish Air Quality Indicator will be developed which will assist in assessing compliance with air quality legislation and delivery of CAFS objectives)</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- A start-up meeting has been held with IOM, CEH and Glasgow University to develop an outline scope of the Scottish Air Quality Indicator.</li> <li>- Key pollutants will be scored for health effects, and background maps developed.</li> <li>- SIMED (Scottish Index for Multiple Environmental Deprivation) data zones are being used for potential exposure which can look at air quality indicators against other factors reported in the same zones.</li> <li>- A progress meeting will be held in the next month to introduce LAs to the Spotfire applications, and how the indicator would be incorporated. This will be available on the web for LAs to use once CAFS progresses.</li> </ul> <p><u>CAFS action LP 4 (Design, develop and implement a 2-level modelling system for regional and local scales...)</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Currently identifying national group members to drive forward regional models – to include Regional Transport Partnerships (RTPs), Regional Development Planning Authorities, Transport Scotland and SEPA. An August meeting will be set up once names are confirmed. This will be the main delivery group for the overall modelling work.</li> </ul> <p><u>CAFS action LP7 (Undertake detailed modelling of all four major cities...)</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <u>Aberdeen</u> model and tools now out for review with Margaret Bell (Newcastle University). CG hopes to get this back by the end of June, but wants a comprehensive review so won't rush return.</li> <li>- <u>Glasgow</u> city model group has been set up. Has identified the model area, data collection requirements, and started building background of model and is looking at methods of determining background concentrations. Aberdeen had this information already - Glasgow is more complex but will inform the rest of the city models.</li> <li>- <u>Edinburgh</u> city model group start-up meeting has been held. Next</li> </ul>	

	<p>meeting planned for July to look at what data is available, and start building background information.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <u>Dundee</u> city model group has identified members and meeting requests are being issued.</li> <li>- Aberdeen city model group to be set up next.</li> <li>- Collecting basic data sets by collating air quality data from diffusion tubes to automatic stations to identify urban background sites. Local weather data also being gathered.</li> <li>- Detailed traffic data collection ongoing, e.g. 52 data collection points in Glasgow, using ANPR and turn counts.</li> </ul> <p><b>Action 5: CG to share NMF programme with EP.</b></p> <p>CG is also involved in some air quality awareness raising events:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Air Time: Part of the Glasgow Science Festival, delivered in partnership with Young Scot on 18 June. 75 young people taking part in activities, experiments and learning around health, commerce, planning and the environment. Will encourage them to develop ideas about how to solve air quality issues.</li> <li>- Successful participants will then pitch these ideas to a panel of experts as part of Venture Jam (6<sup>th</sup>/7<sup>th</sup> August), which is a 3 day innovation workshop for young people to design and develop ideas to improve the environment as part of Venturefest Scotland.</li> </ul>	CG/EP
5.	<p><b><u>CAFS FAQs/lines to take</u></b></p> <p>It was highlighted that there is a need to develop 'lines to take' on CAFS, particularly the NMF (including the Ricardo model being developed), NLEF and funding/resources, to ensure those involved are all communicating consistently with outside stakeholders. These lines will be internal only, and will not be published. Over time an FAQ document may be produced by the Comms group.</p> <p><b>Action 6: ALL to send EP key questions/answers we are likely to be asked on the NMF (including the Ricardo model being developed), NLEF and funding/resources. EP to develop into 'lines to take'.</b></p>	ALL/EP
6.	<p><b><u>STEP Conference</u></b></p> <p>The STEP Conference will take place on Thursday 3<sup>rd</sup> November 2016 at the COSLA building in Haymarket. Draft agenda circulated, which includes a morning session dedicated to CAFS updates/discussion. The transport minister (Humza Yousaf) and the cabinet secretary for rural economy and connectivity (Fergus Ewing) have been approached to speak at the event.</p>	
7.	<p><b><u>Previous minutes/actions</u></b></p> <p>Previous minutes agreed.</p> <p><b><u>Outstanding actions</u></b></p> <p><b>Previous action 2: EP to speak to GD and JC re: inserting Placemaking and Climate Change key tasks into timeline - OPEN</b></p>	EP

	<p>Climate change delivery-group now set up, chaired by JC with first meeting scheduled in July. EP will continue to pursue Placemaking actions/timeline with GD.</p> <p><b>Previous action 5: ALL to let ST know if they have an interest in the CAFS ‘measures requiring further investigation and research’ topics (s.6.31 and 6.32 of CAFS) – OPEN</b></p> <p><b>Previous action 6: Transport Scotland to work up final version of LAQM/NLEF diagram and EP to assist with producing handout with framework summaries – OPEN</b></p> <p>Corrections to be made to diagram by ST and DH as per JB’s comments to bring into line with new LAQM process.</p> <p><b>Previous action 9: AT to redraft letter to all LA Chief Executives highlighting CAFS... - COMPLETE</b></p> <p>A revised letter has been drafted and will be sent to GG asap for comment – now circulated (circulated in EP’s email of 10 June 2016).</p>	<p>ALL</p> <p>ST/DH/EP</p> <p>AT</p>
8.	<p><b><u>AOB</u></b></p> <p>It was queried how best to progress things with the TS policy leads. It was noted that there is a need to understand what’s happening on these actions ‘elsewhere’ e.g. within local authorities and our own organisations.</p> <p><b>Action 7: EP to adjust existing table with updates from Transport Scotland policy leads and key dates/markers where information/input may be required from CAFS GG. ALL to populate with thoughts on what’s being done on these actions in other areas, things that could link in, funding opportunities etc.</b></p> <p><b>Action 8: EP to include slot on agenda at future CAFS GG meeting to discuss/develop thoughts.</b></p> <p>ST is working with the World Road Association (WRA) on air quality and noise. They are seeking case studies on air quality and roads in Scotland between now and mid-2017 – ST to circulate note. WRA are also considering carrying out structured interviews on air quality – ST is producing a questionnaire on the use of ITS to achieve air quality improvements.</p> <p>Questions were raised on the modelling approach currently being developed by Ricardo EAE. AT clarified that Ricardo are developing a commercial model for their own purposes, but it is the NMF model which will be used by LAs to fulfil the CAFS objectives. The need to ensure LAs are aware of this so they don’t spend money on it unnecessarily was highlighted – to be included in ‘lines to take’ (see Action 6 above).</p>	<p>ALL/EP</p> <p>EP</p>
9.	<b>Thanks and Close</b>	