

## Meeting Minutes for Cleaner Air for Scotland Governance Group

**Location:** Scottish Government, Victoria Quay, Commercial Street, Edinburgh, EH6 6QQ  
**Date:** 5 Aug 2016  
**Time:** 10:00 – 13:00

### Present

Graham Applegate, GA (SEPA)	Vincent McNally, VM (Glasgow City Council)
Rachel Brooks (Dundee City Council)	Janice Milne, JM (SEPA)
Janet Brown, JB (City of Edinburgh Council)	Eleanor Pratt, EP (SEPA/TS)
Lorna Bryce, LB (SEPA)	Neil Ritchie, NR (Scottish Government)
James Curran, JC (Scottish Environment Link)	Andrew Taylor, AT (Scottish Government)
Colin Gillespie, CG (SEPA)	Stephen Thomson, ST (Transport Scotland)
Drew Hill, DH (Transport Scotland)	

### Chair

Stephen Thomson (Transport Scotland)

### Apologies

Aileen Brodie, AB (Aberdeen City Council)  
 Gillian Dick, GD (Heads of Planning Scotland)  
 Emilia Hanna, EH (Scottish Environment Link)  
 Bruce Kiloh, BK (SPT)  
 Martin Marsden, MM (SEPA)  
 Denise McCann, DM (SG Health Protection)  
 Colin Ramsay, CR (Health Protection Scotland)  
 Iris Whyte, IW (Dundee City Council)

Item	Title	Action
1.	<p><b><u>Welcome and introductions</u></b></p> <p>EP’s new role as Senior Policy Officer in SEPA’s Air Quality and Energy unit was summarised. In its first year this post will be joint-funded by Scottish Government and focussed on coordinating implementation of CAFS. More in-depth support will be provided to the Comms, Climate Change and Place-making sub-groups, and to the technical framework development as required.</p> <p>EP will also support AT in producing the CAFS progress report, due for publication in November. There will be a need for materials to be submitted for this report around September.</p>	
2.	<p><b><u>Forward programme for CAFS GG meetings</u></b></p> <p>EP provided a summary of the draft forward programme of CAFS meetings (attached to papers). This will be a live document, updated/adjusted as required.</p> <p>It was suggested that the September meeting which focusses on Comms could consider the Scottish Air Quality Database (SAQD) work which will be</p>	

	<p>due to go live around this time.</p> <p>It was agreed that a strategic-level CAFS meeting (to include attendance from SOCOEH, SCOTS, SG Planning and Health Directorates etc.) would be held in October (before school holidays), prior to the STEP Conference in early November. This will provide an opportunity to summarise engagement with ministers, as well as giving high-level stakeholders an update on CAFS progress.</p> <p>Strategic-level meetings will then take place every 3 months as stated in the Terms of Reference.</p> <p>It was noted that the programme for Government will be issued at the end of September, which should be taken into account when reviewing the CAFS GG programme of meetings.</p> <p><b>Action 1: ALL to update EP with suggested topics/timings/potential attendees for future CAFS GG meetings.</b></p> <p>Consideration was given to greater use of tele/videoconferencing facilities to allow CAFS GG members to attend remotely when required, perhaps with members meeting at city-specific ‘hubs’. It was noted that appropriate vc/tc facilities need to be in place for this to work effectively, but agreed that a virtual meeting be trialled when appropriate.</p> <p><b>Action 2: ALL to provide feedback to EP on their organisation’s video/teleconferencing facilities and reliability, prior to trialling a virtual meeting.</b></p> <p>ST flagged a recent discussion around ‘what’ an LEZ is. This generated discussion about the DEFRA Clean Air Zone (CAZ) framework, currently under development and how this term is aligned with/different to ‘our’ CAZs. In Scotland LEZs and CAZs are considered to be different things – DEFRA’s ‘rebranding’ of LEZs as CAZs may cause confusion - we need to keep these separate in our approach. Not just about vehicle access restriction schemes – can be a range of measures.</p>	
<p><b>3.</b></p>	<p><b><u>Climate Change sub-group – update from first meeting</u></b> Draft Terms of Reference circulated in advance.</p> <p>JC provided an overview of the group’s remit and first meeting (held on 15 July 2016). This is quite a complex sub-group with tight timescales, aiming to explore air quality and climate change win-wins and win-losses and provide input to the drafting by Scottish Government of RPP3, with high level information provided initially, and more detailed input once RPP3 is drafted and out for consultation. NR will act as the formal link between the sub group and RPP3.</p>	

	<p>Outputs will be short reports across a variety of ‘sectors’ (transport/domestic/agriculture/waste &amp; circular economy/industry &amp; business) which will also consider cross-cutting themes such as energy supply and the planning review. The group will seek input from Climate Xchange and have approached the SASNet (Scottish Agencies Sustainability Network, previously SENCE) to review the draft material. This report will be presented to the CAFS GG at their meeting on 12 Oct, before submission to Scottish Government by end of October.</p> <p>It was noted that RPP3 is different to RPP2 as it is based on the TIMES model, looking at trade-offs between sectors/Cost Benefit of actions, and allocating a carbon budget to sectors. The new Energy Strategy is also being developed in parallel, which will consider both production and use of energy.</p> <p>The CAFS GG agreed the draft ToRs for this sub-group. JC noted that the ToRs cover tasks up until May 2017, after which the group should be able to review the other climate change actions in CAFS. Potential synergies with the Placemaking work were highlighted.</p> <p><b>Action 3: EP/ST to send CAFS consultation responses to JC to review for other considerations round air quality and climate change.</b></p>	
4.	<p><b><u>Place-Making Actions – workshop approach</u></b></p> <p>EP provided a summary of the suggested approach to the CAFS Place-making actions, based on discussions with GD. 2 of the Place-making actions in CAFS (P3 and P4) are well progressed, with 2 strategic level actions (P1 and P2) around embedding CAFS in Local Development Plans, National Planning Framework and Scottish Planning Policy still to be considered. The ongoing Planning Review needs to be taken into account. Rather than setting up a separate CAFS Place-making sub-group immediately, it is proposed that a workshop be held with key partners (SG Planning; HOPS – Development Management/Development Planning and Energy sub-groups; Improvement Service; LAs etc.) in late November to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Consider what’s already being done within LAs on these actions, where are the gaps etc. to add context to the planning review.</li> <li>• Consider what will be required to deliver the Place-making actions in CAFS and inform the need for any potential CAFS Place-making group going forwards.</li> <li>• Conduct a peer education session on air quality for planners. This can showcase the air quality for planners training that is being developed (CAFS action P4), flag the importance of dealing with issues around air quality proactively, and look at how planning authorities could raise awareness of the aims of CAFS and ensure that it is embedded in their processes.</li> <li>• Perhaps also consider the Place Standard Tool (integrated</li> </ul>	

	<p>way of thinking about place across sectors like transport, housing etc.) and potential for it to encourage proactive front-end conversations around air quality within LAs.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Flag the regional NMF model and workshops that will be identifying strategic requirements for planners.</li> </ul> <p>Meetings are being set up with the Improvement Service and SG Planning to discuss approach/plan workshop. Engagement will also happen with those responsible in SEPA and SG for SEA guidance (CAFS action P5). It was noted by the group that the education session could add more value by also being aligned with noise.</p> <p><b>Action 4: EP/AT to speak to Linda Story re: aligning with noise work.</b></p>	
5.	<p><b><u>Transport Actions – Next Steps</u></b></p> <p>Detailed discussion with the Transport Scotland policy leads at the last meeting identified a number of synergies with the CAFS work, particularly the work of Tom Davy’s team on bus funding. There is still a need to identify milestones for each CAFS action being led by these TS leads to ensure the CAFS GG understands where to provide input/add value at the right time. Conversations with the individual leads are happening within SG/TS, but the importance of maintaining dialogue was highlighted in order to make sure progress continues to be made. EP highlighted that GG members were requested to provide key thoughts/points for communication to the TS leads, but had yet to receive any.</p> <p><b>Action 5: ST to map out key points for engagement with TS policy leads.</b></p> <p><b>Action 6: ALL to provide input to EP re: key points to be communicated to TS leads.</b></p> <p><b>Action 7: EP to issue CAFS GG minutes to TS policy leads, and request briefing notes back at appropriate times e.g. strategic meetings.</b></p> <p>ST highlighted the CAFS Transport ‘areas for further investigation’. There is European LES guidance coming out which may cover these areas which should be taken into account.</p> <p><b>Action 8: ST to provide summary of what’s happening with other areas of investigation and link to European LES guidance being produced.</b></p> <p>VM highlighted the Eurocities work on real world emissions – briefing notes attached to papers.</p>	

<p>6.</p>	<p>JC raised concerns on behalf of Scottish Environment Link regarding LEZ implementation and compliance timescales. JC argued the need for the CAFS GG to make sure appropriate timescales and delivery mechanisms are in place to ensure 2020 compliance is achieved. He noted gaps on the delivery plan and strongly suggested some form of programme management resource should be in place to assist in managing the high-level programme, identifying risks, and reviewing progress against deliverables.</p> <p>It was noted that delivery of CAFS actions is the responsibility of Scottish Government, rather than the Governance Group. The need to focus on the suite of NLEF options, as a useful framework to provide evidence based solutions, rather than pre-emptively focussing on one option (LEZs) was highlighted. It was also noted that the projections for 2020 compliance are not based solely on implementation of LEZs/NLEF options, but factor in work LAs are already doing within their air quality action plans. The Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform has also restated the commitment to meeting 2020 AQ targets</p> <p>Concerns about resources were noted, with the ongoing spending review and 1 year budget highlighted. ST stated that recruitment was about to commence for an administrator role within the Transport Scotland Environment and Sustainability team, which could also provide programme management support for CAFS, supporting EP to ensure things are delivered on time and to standard, risk analysis etc.</p> <p><b>Action 9: ST to circulate draft wording on admin support role.</b></p>	
<p>7.</p>	<p><b><u>NMF/NLEF/Comms briefing notes</u></b></p> <p>Briefing notes on the NMF/NLEF and Comms work were circulated in advance of the meeting.</p> <p>Future briefing notes to include the <u>ask</u> from GG members.</p> <p><b>Action 10: EP to produce CAFS briefing template based on actions, what happened last month, upcoming actions over next month etc.</b></p> <p><u>National Modelling Framework</u></p> <p>CG noted that a national delivery group is being formed to progress development of the NMF regional model. Membership will be drawn from the various city-specific NMF groups, but CG is keen for input on others who should be invited to the national group.</p> <p><b>Action 11: ALL to provide input to CG on potential members for national NMF group.</b></p> <p>DH noted the intention to hold a meeting linking NMF and NLEF modelling as</p>	

per 5.1 on the NLEF programme (attached to NLEF briefing note), to present on existing transport models and consider their integration to the NMF work (NB this event is now scheduled for 6 September 2016 – contact DH for details).

#### National Low Emission Framework

DH noted in addition to the briefing note that the second meeting of the NLEF steering group happened recently – minutes will be produced. There is the intention to develop membership further with more transport and planning specialists. The framework for contractors will be issued shortly.

The need for weekly catch ups between CG and DH was noted, to ensure strong links between the NMF and NLEF workstreams, with Alan Hills (SEPA) also sitting on the NLEF steering group.

It was also suggested that wider SEPA representation (beyond modellers) should be identified to ensure correct links between the NLEF and LAQM. Concerns were expressed that there is a need for representatives on the steering group who deal with LAQM on a daily basis, particularly if the intention is to include SEPA in the process of assessing local authorities. DH clarified that SEPA will be included, although it was noted that there is currently no mention of SEPA as a partner organisation in the NLEF briefing note.

#### **Action 12: DH to adjust NLEF briefing note to include SEPA.**

It was queried which LAs are currently included on the NLEF steering group. Currently VM is representing Glasgow, but stated that other LAs should also be represented. DH agreed, but highlighted the need to engage those who will be involved in delivery of NLEF options (transport/planning) rather than environmental health. DH is currently engaging with heads of transport and planning at the key LAs with a view to getting representatives on the steering group. Terms of Reference for the NLEF steering group are also being developed.

#### Comms

LB noted that the 'core' CAFS comms group (consisting of comms professionals from TS/SEPA/SG/HPS plus technical support from ST, EP and CR) will be supplemented by an 'outer tier' of partner organisations such as Friends of the Earth Scotland, Environmental Protection Scotland, NHS, British Heart Foundation etc.

It was highlighted the NHS Health Improvement (as well as Health Protection Scotland) has now been engaged in this work – this is important for calls to action/behaviour change etc.

A Comms workshop is planned for 1 Sep 2016, which will be fed back on at

	<p>the next CAFS GG meeting. This workshop will develop a CAFS briefing pack for partner organisations and consider the Sniffer brief to develop a roadmap for engagement towards delivery of NLEF options. This project will be managed by a steering group to shape direction of work and support Sniffer in finding wider materials, including FoES (lobbying/engagement expertise), DH/CG, etc.</p> <p>LB noted some difficulties with getting wider engagement to progress actions - the majority of this work is being carried out by SEPA. It was noted that the comms group is under-resourced for what we need to deliver, and not able to take on additional work. Some form of project management resource would ideally be required to support this work. The current timeline of activity will be turned into a 'resource requirement' to illustrate what is required and when. It was also highlighted that it will be important to consider wider opportunities and engagement within activities that are already planned e.g. round RPP3.</p> <p><b>Action 13: LB to turn comms activities timeline into resource planner for circulation.</b></p>	
8.	<p><b><u>Previous minutes/actions</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>Previous Action 2 (10 June 2016) EP/DH to develop timetable of key points for engagement between CAFS GG and TS policy leads - SUPERCEDED by Action 5 above.</b></li> <li>- <b>Previous Action 4 (10 June 2016) DH to issue calendar of NLEF steering group meetings to inform CAFS GG when these are taking place – DH to include in next NLEF briefing note.</b></li> <li>- <b>Previous Action 6 (6 May 2016) Transport Scotland to work up final version of LAQM/NLEF diagram - ST to incorporate JB's comments</b></li> <li>- <b>Previous Action 9 (6 May 2016) Letter to LA Chief Executives – letter has been redrafted and the cabinet secretary will be asked to sign it prior to circulation.</b></li> </ul>	
9.	<p><b><u>AOB</u></b></p> <p>The Holyrood Air Quality event previously scheduled for September has now been postponed to 8 November.</p> <p>The CAFS Progress report will require concise input from each workstream. Noted need to ensure time set aside to complete this.</p> <p><b>Action 14: EP/AT to consider CAFS Progress Report template/framework that leads can populate.</b></p> <p>It was noted that the development of the Scottish Air Quality Indicator will inform the development of the CAFS KPIs.</p>	

	<p>ST raised the issue of low cost sensors and suggested it may be worth setting up a debate on their role in this work. There was some appetite for this idea, and discussion followed on what format such a debate may take.</p> <p>Concerns were expressed again that we not delivering on key elements of the CAFS TORs, with the suggestion made that the agenda could be structured around these ToR points to ensure they are considered at every meeting:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Programme planning overview included as specific agenda item</li> <li>- Ensuring delivery to time/specification: consider in progress reports</li> <li>- Agree delivery groups – sub group reporting</li> <li>- Escalation route – risk</li> <li>- Ensure work open and transparent – how are we communicating.</li> </ul> <p><b>Action 15: EP to consider how to include these points in future agendas.</b></p>	
10.	<b>Thanks and Close</b>	